

CLEARY GOTTlieb STEEN & HAMILTON LLP

ONE LIBERTY PLAZA

NEW YORK, NY 10006-1470

(212) 225-2000

FACSIMILE (212) 225-3999

WWW.CLEARYGOTTLIEB.COM

WASHINGTON, DC • PARIS • BRUSSELS • LONDON • MOSCOW
 FRANKFURT • COLOGNE • ROME • MILAN • HONG KONG
 BEIJING • BUENOS AIRES • SÃO PAULO • ABU DHABI • SEOUL

Written Direct Dial: +1 (212) 225-2000
 E-Mail: lliman@cgs.com

LAURENT ALPERT
 VICTOR I. LEWKOW
 LESLIE H. SILVERMAN
 ROBERT L. TORTORELLO
 LEE C. BUCHHEIT
 JAMES M. FEASLEE
 ALAN L. BELLER
 THOMAS J. MCONEY
 JONATHAN I. BLACKMAN
 MICHAEL L. RYAN
 ROBERT P. DAVIS
 YARON Z. REICH
 RICHARD S. LINCER
 STEVEN G. HOROWITZ
 JAMES A. DUNCAN
 STEVEN M. LOEB
 CRAIG B. BROD
 MITCHELL A. LOWENTHAL
 EDWARD J. ROSEN
 LAWRENCE B. FRIEDMAN
 NICOLAS GRABAR
 CHRISTOPHER E. AUSTIN
 SETTI GROSSHANDLER
 WILLIAM A. GROLL
 HOWARD S. ZELBO
 DAVID E. BRODSKY
 MICHAEL R. LAZERWITZ
 ARTHUR H. KOHN
 RICHARD J. COOPER
 JEFFREY S. LEWIS
 PAUL J. SHIM
 STEVEN L. WILNER
 ERICA W. NUENHUIS
 LINDSEY P. GRANFIELD
 ANDRES DE LA CRUZ
 DAVID C. LOPEZ
 CARMEN A. CORRALES
 JAMES L. BROMLEY

MICHAEL A. GERSTENZANG
 LEWIS J. LIMAN
 LEV L. DASSIN
 NEIL G. WIGORISKEY
 JORGE U. JIANTORENA
 MICHAEL D. WEINBERGER
 DAVID LEINWAND
 JEFFREY A. ROSENTHAL
 ETHAN A. KLINGSBERG
 MICHAEL J. VOLKOVITSCH
 MICHAEL D. DAYAN
 CARMINE D. BOCCUZZI, JR.
 JEFFREY D. KARP
 KIMBERLY BROWN BLACKLOW
 ROBERT J. RAYMOND
 LEONARD C. JACOBY
 SANDRA L. FLOW
 FRANCISCO L. CESTERO
 FRANCESCA L. ODELL
 WILLIAM L. MCRAE
 JASON FACTOR
 MARGARET S. PERONIS
 LISA M. SCHWEITZER
 JUAN G. GIRALDEZ
 DUANE MCLAUGHLIN
 BREON S. PEACE
 MEREDITH E. KOTLER
 CHANTAL E. KORDULA
 BENET J. O'NEILLY
 DAVID AMAN
 ADAM E. FLEISHER
 SEAN A. ONEAL
 GLENN P. MCGORRY
 MATTHEW P. SALERNO
 MICHAEL J. ALBANO
 VICTOR L. HOU
 ROGER A. COOPER
 AMY R. SHAPIRO

JENNIFER KENNEDY PARK
 ELIZABETH LENAS
 LUKE A. BARCFoot
 RANGLA L. MARCOGLIESE
 PAUL M. TIGER
 JONATHAN S. KOLODNER
 RESIDENT PARTNERS

SANDRA M. ROCKS
 S. DOUGLAS BORISKY
 JUDITH KASSEL
 DAVID E. WEBB
 PENELOPE L. CHRISTOPHOUD
 BOAZ S. MORAG
 MARY E. ALCOCK
 DAVID H. HERRINGTON
 HEIDE H. ILGENFRTZ
 HUGH C. CONROY, JR.
 KATHLEEN M. EMBERGER
 WALLACE L. LARSON, JR.
 JAMES D. SMALL
 AVRAM E. LUFT
 DANIEL ILAN
 ANDREW WEAVER
 HELENA K. GRANNIS
 GRANT M. BINGER
 MEYER H. FEDIDA
 JOHN V. HARRISON
 CAROLINE F. HAYDAY
 RESIDENT COUNSEL

LOUISE M. PARENT
 OF COUNSEL

USDC SDNY
 DOCUMENT
 ELECTRONICALLY FILED
 DOC#
 DATE FILED: 1/29/15

BY ECF

VIA ECF

Hon. Andrew J. Peck, U.S.M.J.
 Southern District of New York
 Daniel Patrick Moynihan Courthouse
 500 Pearl Street, Courtroom 20D
 New York, New York 10007

MEMO ENDORSED 1/28/15
 Rio Tinto INVESTIGATIVE REPORTS DUE
 BY 2/2/15.

SO ORDERED:

Hon. Andrew J. Peck
 United States Magistrate Judge

Re: *Rio Tinto plc v. Vale S.A., et al.*, Civil Action No. 14-cv-3042 (RMB) (AJP) (S.D.N.Y.)

Dear Judge Peck:

We write on behalf of defendant Vale S.A. ("Vale") in response to the letter of plaintiff Rio Tinto plc ("Rio Tinto"), dated January 27, 2015 (Dk. 166), in which Plaintiff informed the Court that it violated its second Court-ordered deadline for production of documents responsive to Vale's BHP-related document requests and requested an extension. We write briefly to explain why Vale could not consent to Plaintiff's request for another extension, and also to request an order from the Court that Plaintiff produce its investigative reports (a production that the Court ordered expedited on January 13) by January 30, 2015.

On December 9, 2014, Your Honor ordered Rio Tinto to make a complete production of the BHP documents from five custodians by January 9, 2015. Plaintiff failed to meet that deadline, blaming a vendor issue, and asked the Court for two to three additional weeks. Your Honor's response was emphatic: "Two weeks, period. Get it done. Have them do overtime if need be. Get it done. Two weeks from today." Jan. 13, 2015 Tr. 45:3-5.

On January 26, 2015, Plaintiff informed Vale that it would not meet this new, extended deadline, citing a "technical issue that occurred during Rio Tinto's data extraction." Vale has granted Plaintiff extensions of discovery deadlines on several occasions, including a one-week extension to serve responses and objections. We also have not objected on the repeated occasions when Rio Tinto has asked for more time than that originally suggested by the Court. However, in this instance, Rio Tinto had already missed the Court's initial deadline for this

Hon. Andrew J. Peck, p. 2

production, making only a partial production on that date. Rio Tinto's suggestion that it should not be held to production deadlines simply because it has to date produced more documents than Vale is untenable. And Plaintiff's current excuse for failing to abide by the Court's order, a technical issue with Rio Tinto's data extraction (which, for all Vale knows, is the same vendor issue Plaintiff raised two weeks ago), is insufficient to excuse further delay. Any such technical issue should have been identified and addressed more than a month ago, or brought to the Court's attention, at the latest, during the January 13, 2015 conference, not raised only on the eve of Plaintiff's already-extended deadline. This further failure is prejudicial to Vale, which should have been given all these documents weeks ago. Vale was therefore not in a position to acquiesce to yet another delay.

On a related matter, Rio Tinto seems to be ignoring the Court's order to expeditiously produce its investigative reports, despite its agreement two weeks ago to expedite production of these reports. Jan. 13, 2015 Tr. 52:1. The Court specifically ordered that Plaintiff produce these "very quickly," *see id.* at 52:18-21 ("Let's expedite the production of those reports. Presumably, your client knows where to find those very quickly."), yet Plaintiff has still failed to produce them, stating only it will do so before the next status conference before Your Honor on February 6. Given the Court's instructions to produce the reports expeditiously, there is no justification for this continued and arbitrary delay. Vale requests that Plaintiff be ordered to produce the investigative reports by January 30, 2015.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Lewis J. Liman
Lewis J. Liman